Land Use, Landmarks & Planning Committee
Wednesday, May 1, 2019, 6:30 PM
Bonifacio Senior Center, 7 East 116th Street

*** Minutes ***

Present: La Shawn Henry, Xiomara Pedraza, Robert Perkins, Shantal Sparks, Vincent Torres, Steven Villanueva (Chair), Candy Vives-Vasquez, Angel Mescain (staff)

Excused: Henry Flores, Joseph Goldbloom, Frances Mastrota, Jonathan Winstone

Absent: Holley Drakeford

Guests: Raffaela Dunne, Washington Square Partners; David Karnovsky, Fried Frank; Sam White, PBDW Architects; Jodi Stein, Herrick; Angel Salvatore, Archdiocese of NY; Penny King, Fried Frank; Hallia Baker, Harlem Neighbors; Kathy Benson, Landmarks East Harlem; Veronica Chuah, Herrick; Migna Taveras, Archcare; Valerie Campbell, Kramer Levin; Paul Travis, Washington Square Partners; Scott LaRus, Archcare; Everett Person, Community United Methodist Church; Joe Huennekens, NYC DCP; Chris Cirillo, Landmarks East Harlem;

1. Call to Order – Adoption of Agenda

   • Meeting called to order 6:44pm
   • Motion to adopt agenda by Vincent Torres, seconded by Robert Perkins

2. Informational Updates

   a. East Harlem Historic District

      Chris Cirillo, a member of Landmarks East Harlem, provided the committee with an update on the East Harlem historic district designation along 116th street which was approved by the State in March 2019. Centered on East 116th street and pleasant avenue, the historic district includes 820 buildings; 677 of which are considered “contributing” structures that meet the criteria of age (1865-1965), and architectural integrity.
Homeowners within the historic district are eligible for the state historic tax credit which may help them finance the rehabilitation of their properties. The historic district will be on the National Register this summer.

Landmarks East Harlem is also seeking a grant to survey a portion of East Harlem north of 125th street to 132nd street and from Park Avenue to Lenox Avenue to study the architectural significance and potentially apply for historic district designation. Future RFE's Individual Landmark properties:

-Mt. Carmel Church
-FDNY Engine 91

LaShawn asked whether historic district designation would burden affordable housing properties or prevent affordable housing development. Chris replied that State designation would make it easier for owners to maintain and develop properties within the district because they would be eligible for the historic tax credit incentive.

3. Presentations & Discussions

a. Presentation of application to the Board of Standards & Appeals for a zoning variance to facilitate a 9,808-sf enlargement of the Reece School located at 25-27 East 104th Street

Representatives from the Reece school, an educational facility for children with special needs, presented to the committee on their BSA application and are seeking a letter of support from the Community Board. The BSA variance will specifically address setback regulations to build additional floors and maximize floor space for the children they serve.

The school's class sizes have grown because of the recent addition of 7th and 8th-grade classes. 60% of their students come from northern Manhattan and the Bronx and the school currently serves 130 students. Due to the high staff to student ratio's required to support their student population (including physical therapists, occupational therapists, and counselors) and the space required to provide specialty services, the school is bursting at the seams and there is currently no space for a cafeteria.

The architect explained that they could build higher (an additional 5 floors) as of right, but the setback creates an inefficient floor plan (smaller floor space on each floor). The proposed plan violates the setback requirements but allows for the staff to be located on the same floor as the classrooms and also accommodates a cafeteria and OT, PT open space workroom for children.

Steven went to visit the school and confirmed that they were using every square inch of space that they could. He also explained that children with IEPs are required to have a higher teacher to student ratio and therefore need smaller classroom sizes and additional staff.

Presenters also explained that this would be a prevailing wage project.
Candy motioned to provide a letter in support of the BSA variance and the motion was seconded by LaShawn. The motion passed unanimously.

b. Review of land use applications, 190158ZMM and 190156ZRM, related to the Terence Cardinal Cooke Rezoning

Presenters: Scott President of ArchCare and Rafaela Dunn of Washington Square Partners (Consultant)

Terrance Cardinal Cooke, a skilled nursing facility in East Harlem, is seeking to modernize their facility and develop supportive housing as part of their redevelopment plan in order to reduce the number of beds in their skilled nursing facility. The total investment needed to modernize the skilled nursing facility is $100 million.

The supportive housing contemplated would provide permanently affordable housing with supportive services for seniors currently living at TCC who do not require nursing home level care. ArchCare believes that there are approximately 150 individuals in their nursing home that do not necessarily need skilled nursing and could live independently within senior housing with supportive services. The intent is to obtain section 8 rental assistance and HPD subsidy to support senior housing accommodations. The Land Use action sought to redevelop Terrance Cardinal Cooke is a rezoning from an R7-2 to R8 and R8, C1-5. Because the area would be upzoned, residential developments would be subject to MIH.

The first phase of the project will modernize and rehabilitate the flower building or skilled nursing facility while the second phase will demolish an existing parking garage in order to build the supportive senior housing. ArchCare would also sell a portion of the lot to a developer in order to finance renovations. It is believed the developer could build a market rate residential tower with some affordable housing. The tower would be subject to MIH, but the affordable housing would be provided offsite, by the new senior housing project next door.

TCC does not anticipate that the project will be prevailing wage. However, it will be their intent to hire and engage local community contactors and hire local community members to the extent possible.

32BJ representatives present during the meeting expressed concerns that ArchCare has not made a commitment to pay building service workers in their new residential development a prevailing wage. However, the market rate development will be developed, owned and operated by a private developer and ArchCare cannot predict whether or not the owner will offer prevailing wage to building employees. LaShawn implored ArchCare to partner with a local nonprofit developer on their senior housing project and the presenters made a verbal commitment to sit down with local developers to see if they would be able to work together.

c. Review of application to the Landmarks Preservation Commission concerning All Saints Church located at 47 East 129th Street – Block 1754, Lots 20 and 24
Valery Campbell presented to the committee on behalf of All Saints Church, a landmarked building on 129th Street. The structure has sat vacant since 2011 due to a declining congregation and the Archdiocese is now seeking to relegate the church to secular use and sell the property. According to canon law, all sacred monuments must be removed and kept at the Archdiocese in order to convert to secular use—a process that must first be approved by the Landmarks Preservation Commission. Representatives of the All Saints Church are seeking a letter of support from the Community Board to accompany their application to the Landmarks Preservation Commission.

The Architect, Sam White of PBDW Architects, further clarified that although the landmark consists of a church, rectory, and a school, the application is addressing the church and rectory primarily.

Xio asked whom they intend on conveying the property to and Mr. LaRue stated that they are working with a real estate broker who is still in the process of finding potential buyers and is also reaching out to nonprofit organizations who may be interested. According to the presenters, if the application to the City’s Landmarks Preservation Commission is denied, the structure will continue to be vacant. If the site were sold, the structured could be adapted for community facility or residential use, which would help maintain the landmark in the long term. Members of the committee expressed concerns that supporting the application would open the door for a future sale and development of the property for a use that the committee may not support such as market rate housing.

Vinny motioned to decline the BSA application. The motion was seconded by Robert and passed with one opposing vote.

d. Informational presentation regarding Metropolitan Community United Methodist Church located at Madison Avenue & East 126th Street

Presenter: Everett Person

Permits were filed to demolish the Metropolitan Community United Methodist Church located at Madison Avenue & East 126th Street in January of this year. The permits were not approved by the board of trustees and the person who filed was not an elected officer, which violates laws governing the Methodist church.

The presenter is seeking a resolution to oppose demolition plans. According to the presenter, the board of trustees is divided on the matter, however, he believes with political and community support the church can be saved.

Orlando Rodriguez, a Senior Planner at Borough President Brewer’s office, stated that the BP has been in conversation with Landmarks Preservation Commission to designate the building as a landmark and save it from demolition and that a letter of support from the Board may help further that conversation.
Robert also mentioned that the opposition has collected over 200 signatures and letters to the Bishop from local residents and congregation members.

Ms. Bradly, a member of the public, commented that the Pastor was promised a new residence by the developer in exchange for supporting the sale.

**Robert Motion for a letter of support in protest of the demolition of the Metropolitan Methodist Church, Vinny seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.**

4. New Business

5. Old Business

   a. Revised of CB11 City Properties Checklist & Affordability Guidelines

   Steve asks that members of the committee read and comment on the documents for vote at next month’s Land Use Meeting

   b. Continuing discussion on District Needs and Budget Requests

   Steve asks committee members to attend a working session between land use meetings in order to prepare for action items.

   c. Committee attendance

6. Announcements

   a. May 6th and 13th Community Visioning Workshops for POA sites.

   b. There will be a working session on May 8th and the 15th at 6pm at the Board Office to draft recommendations for the POA sites from the Community Board

7. Adjournment